

Proposed amendments to the EU Regulation on the digitalisation of justice

European Disability Forum

July 2022

EDF's Proposed amendments to the Regulation on the digitalisation of judicial cooperation and access to justice

Funded by the European Union. Views and opinions expressed are however those of the author(s) only and do not necessarily reflect those of the European Union or the European Commission. Neither the European Union nor the granting authority can be held responsible for them



Funded by the European Union

Table of Contents

Table of Contents2
Introduction2
Executive Summary2
Proposed amendments to articles of the Regulation4
Article 4: Establishment of a European electronic access points4
Article 5: Means of communication between natural or legal persons and competent authorities5
Article 7: Hearing through videoconferencing or other distance communication technology in civil and commercial matters
Article 8: Hearing through videoconferencing or other distance communication technology in criminal proceedings7
Article 11: Electronic payment of fees9
Article 12 (adoption of implementing acts by the Commission) and article 13 (reference implementation software)9
Proposed new recitals11
Document credits13

Introduction

This document presents amendments to the proposed regulation on the digitalisation of judicial cooperation COM (2021) 759 final. It should be read along with <u>EDF recommendations</u> to the public consultation on the subject in 2020.

The European Disability Forum

The European Disability Forum (EDF) is an independent NGO that represents the interests of 100 million Europeans with disabilities. EDF is a unique platform which brings together representative organisation of persons with disabilities from across Europe. EDF is run by persons with disabilities and their families. We are a strong, united voice of persons with disabilities in Europe.

Executive Summary

We deeply regret the absence of accessibility requirements, procedural accommodations for persons with disabilities and reference to the United Nations Convention on the Rights of

Persons with Disabilities (CRPD)¹ in the proposed Regulation on the digitalisation of judicial cooperation and access to justice.

Under the **CRPD** the EU and its Member States have the obligation to ensure access to the justice system, both for legal professionals with disabilities and people with disabilities seeking justice. This includes ensuring the accessibility of the justice system and that procedural accommodations (e.g. sign language interpretation, remote participation, etc.) are available to people with disabilities throughout the justice process. This is very important in the digitalisation of justice at EU and national level.

Access to Justice is one of the priorities in the Union of Equality and the **European Disability Rights Strategy 2021-2030**², with reference to International Principles and Guidelines on Access to Justice for Persons with Disabilities³. Accessibility also is part of the EU Justice Scoreboard 2022⁴.

EU legislation on accessibility

The lack of accessibility in the proposed regulation is concerning, as several EU acts relating to digitalisation and accessibility already exist, covering a wide range of technologies and digital content. These EU legislations provide a set of accessibility requirements which are supported by European standards on accessibility.

We propose amendments in line with:

- The European Accessibility Act⁵ (EAA)
- The Web Accessibility Directive⁶ (WAD) covering public body websites and mobile applications
- The Electronic Communications Code⁷
- The Public Procurement Directive⁸

¹ <u>Council decision 2010/48/EC</u>

² European Disability Rights Strategy 2021-2030, see 5.1.

³ UN International principles and guidelines on access to justice for persons with disabilities <u>International</u> <u>Principles and Guidelines on Access to Justice for Persons with Disabilities (un.org)</u>

⁴ EU Justice Score Board 2022

⁵ European Accessibility Act (EU) 2019/882

⁶ <u>Web Accessibility Directive (EU) 2016/2102</u>Error! Hyperlink reference not valid.

⁷ European Electronic Communication Code (EU) 2018/1972

⁸ <u>Public Procurement Directive 2014/24/EU</u>; Article 42 covers **all procurement** "intended for use by natural persons, whether general public or staff of the contracting authority, the technical specifications shall, except

- Harmonised standard EN 301 549 Accessibility requirements for ICT products and services
- European standard EN 17161 Accessibility following a Design for all approach (up for harmonisation in relation to the European Accessibility Act)

The text of the Regulation should make explicit references to the European Accessibility Act (EAA). The EAA includes the same accessibility requirements for websites, apps and digital documents as the Web Accessibility Directive, but it also covers other ICT products and services, such as computers and operating systems, electronic communications, or digital identification and payment methods, among others, which would apply for judicial cooperation and access to justice. We propose such reference to the Accessibility Act to ensure legal coherence and implementation as for the accessibility for persons with disabilities.

Proposed amendments to articles of the Regulation

Article 4: Establishment of a European electronic access points		
Commission proposal	Proposed amendments	
1. A European electronic access point shall be established on the European e- Justice Portal, to be used for electronic communication between natural or legal persons and competent authorities in cases falling under the scope of the legal acts listed in Annex I.	1. A European electronic access point shall be established on the European e- Justice Portal, to be used for electronic communication between natural or legal persons and competent authorities in cases falling under the scope of the legal acts listed in Annex I. <i>The European</i> <i>electronic access point shall meet the</i>	
2. The Commission shall be responsible for the technical management, development, maintenance, security and	accessibility requirements set out in annex I of Directive (EU) 2019/882 .	
support of the European electronic	2. The Commission shall be responsible	

in duly justified cases, be drawn up to take into account accessibility criteria for persons with disabilities or design for all users."

access point.

3. The European electronic access point

shall allow natural and legal persons to

file claims, launch requests, send and receive procedurally relevant information

^{2.} The Commission shall be responsible for the technical management, development, maintenance, security, *accessibility,* and support of the European electronic access point.

and communicate with the competent authorities.	3. The European electronic access point shall allow natural and legal persons to file claims, launch requests, send and receive procedurally relevant information and communicate with the competent authorities.
Just	ification:

To ensure equal access to justice it is paramount for European electronic access points to be accessible to users with disabilities, including members of the legal professions, employees, and citizens.

Article 5: Means of communication between natural or legal persons and competent authorities

Commission proposal	Proposed amendments
1. Written communication between	1. Written communication between
natural or legal persons and competent	natural or legal persons and competent
authorities falling within the scope of the	authorities falling within the scope of the
legal acts listed in Annex I, may be	legal acts listed in Annex I, may be
carried out by the following electronic	carried out by the following electronic
means: (a) the European electronic	means: (a) the European electronic
access point; or (b) national IT portals,	access point; or (b) national IT portals,
where available.	where available.
2. Competent authorities shall	2. Competent authorities shall
communicate with natural and legal	communicate with natural and legal
persons through the European electronic	persons through the European electronic
access point, where that natural or legal	access point, where that natural or legal
person gave prior express consent to the	person gave prior express consent to the
use of this means of communication.	use of this means of communication and
	that it is accessible to persons with
3. Communication under paragraph 1	disabilities.
shall be considered equivalent to written	
communication under the applicable	3. Communication under paragraph 1
procedural rules	shall be considered equivalent to written
	communication under the applicable
	procedural rules
Justification:	
To onsure equal access to justice and the right to a fair trial it is paramount for	

To ensure equal access to justice and the right to a fair trial it is paramount for European electronic access points to be accessible to users with disabilities, including natural persons such as members of the legal professions, employees, and citizens.

Article 7: Hearing through videoconferencing or other distance communication technology in civil and commercial matters

Commission proposal	Proposed amendments
1. Without prejudice to specific	1. Without prejudice to specific provisions
provisions regulating the use of	regulating the use of videoconferencing
videoconferencing or other distance	or other distance communication
communication technology in	technology in proceedings under the legal
proceedings under the legal acts listed in	acts listed in Annex I, and upon request
Annex I, and upon request of a party to	of a party to proceedings falling under the
proceedings falling under the scope of	scope of these legal acts or in other civil
these legal acts or in other civil and	and commercial matters where one of the
commercial matters where one of the	parties is present in another Member
parties is present in another Member	State, or upon request of their legal or
State, or upon request of their legal or	authorised representative, competent
authorised representative, competent	authorities shall allow their participation to
authorities shall allow their participation	a hearing by videoconferencing or other
to a hearing by videoconferencing or other distance communication	distance communication technology,
	provided that:
technology, provided that:	(a) such technology is available, and
(a) such technology is available, and	accessible, as per accessibility
	requirements set out in annex I of
(b) the other party or parties to the	directive (EU) 2019/882 of the
proceedings were given the possibility to	European Parliament and of the
submit an opinion on the use of	Council of 17 April 2019 on the
videoconferencing or other distance	accessibility requirements for
communication technology.	products and services, and
2. A request for conducting on oral	(b) the other ports or portion to the
2. A request for conducting an oral hearing through videoconferencing or	(b) the other party or parties to the proceedings were given the possibility to
other distance communication	submit an opinion on the use of
technology may be refused by the	videoconferencing or other distance
competent authority where the particular	communication technology;
circumstances of the case are not	
compatible with the use of such	(c) procedural accommodations are
technology.	granted at the request of any party
	with disabilities.
3. Competent authorities may on their	
own motion allow the participation of	2. A request for conducting an oral
parties to hearings by videoconference,	hearing through videoconferencing or
provided that all parties to the	other distance communication technology
proceedings are given the possibility to	may be refused by the competent
submit an opinion on the use of	authority where the particular
videoconferencing or other distance	circumstances of the case are not
communication technology	compatible with the use of such technology.
	leomology.
	3. Competent authorities may on their

3. Competent authorities may on their own motion allow the participation of

parties to hearings by videoconference, provided that all parties to the proceedings are given the possibility to submit an opinion on the use of videoconferencing or other distance communication technology and that the videoconferencing or other distance communication technology is
accessible as set out in accordance with paragraph 1 (a).
vification

Justification:

In order to ensure equal access to justice, videoconferencing solutions must be accessible to users with disabilities, including natural persons such as members of the legal professions, employees, and citizens.

Procedural accommodations must be granted to parties with disabilities to ensure their right to access to justice, as required under Article 13 of the CRPD. They are measures aimed at removing barriers in accessing justice, for example measures needed to ensure communication with the court. Contrary to reasonable accommodations, procedural accommodations cannot be exempted based on "undue burden" including costs, as they are necessary to ensure the fundamental right to a fair trial. The right to right to an effective remedy and to a fair trial is protected under Article 47 of the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union.

Article 8: Hearing through videoconferencing or other distance communication technology in criminal proceedings

Commission proposal	Proposed amendments
1. Where the competent authority of a	1. Where the competent authority of a
Member State requests the hearing of a	Member State requests the hearing of a
suspect, accused or convicted person in	suspect, accused or convicted person in
proceedings under the legal acts listed in	proceedings under the legal acts listed in
Annex II, the competent authority shall	Annex II, the competent authority shall
allow their participation to the hearing by	allow their participation to the hearing by
videoconferencing or other distance	videoconferencing or other distance
communication technology, provided	communication technology, provided that:
that:	
	(a) such technology is available and
(a) such technology is available;	accessible as per accessibility
(b) the perticular circumstances of the	requirements set out in annex I of
(b) the particular circumstances of the	directive (EU) 2019/882 of the
case justify the use of such technology;	European Parliament and of the
(c) the suspect, accused or convicted	Council of 17 April 2019 on the accessibility requirements for
persons expressed consent on the use of	products and services;
videoconferencing or other distance	

communication technology. Before expressing consent on the use of	(b) the particular circumstances of the case justify the use of such technology;
videoconferencing or other distance	
communication technology the suspect	(c) the suspect, accused or convicted
or the accused person shall have the	persons expressed consent on the use of
possibility to seek the advice of a lawyer	videoconferencing or other distance
in accordance with Directive 2013/48/EU.	communication technology. Before expressing consent on the use of
2. Paragraph 1 is without prejudice to the	videoconferencing or other distance
provisions regulating the use of	communication technology the suspect or
videoconferencing or other distance	the accused person shall have the
communication technology in the legal	possibility to seek the advice of a lawyer
acts listed in Annex II.	in accordance with Directive 2013/48/EU;
3. Subject to this Regulation, the	(d) procedural accommodation is
procedure for conducting a videoconference shall be regulated by	provided to the suspect, accused or convicted person with disabilities.
the national law of the Member State	convicted person with disabilities.
conducting the videoconference.	2. Paragraph 1 is without prejudice to the
<u> </u>	provisions regulating the use of
	videoconferencing or other distance
	communication technology in the legal
	acts listed in Annex II.
	3. Subject to this Regulation, the
	procedure for conducting a
	videoconference shall be regulated by the
	national law of the Member State
	conducting the videoconference.
luctifi	cation:

In order to ensure equal access to justice and the right to a fair trial, videoconferencing solutions must be accessible to users with disabilities, including natural persons such as members of the legal professions, employees, and citizens.

Procedural accommodations must be granted to suspect, accused or convicted persons with disabilities to ensure their right to a fair trial, as required by Article 13 of the CRPD. They are measures aimed at removing barriers in accessing justice, for example measures needed to ensure communication with the court. Contrary to reasonable accommodations, procedural accommodations cannot be exempted based on "undue burden" including costs, as they are necessary to ensure the fundamental right to a fair trial. The right to right to an effective remedy and to a fair trial is protected under Article 47 of the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union.

Article 11: Electronic payment of fees

Commission proposal	Proposed amendments
1. Member States shall provide for the	1. Member States shall provide for the
possibility of electronic payment of fees,	possibility of electronic payment of fees,
including from Member States other than	including from Member States other than
where the competent authority is situated.	where the competent authority is situated.
	2. Member States shall provide for
2. Member States shall provide for	technical means allowing the payment of
technical means allowing the payment of	the fees referred to in paragraph 1
the fees referred to in paragraph 1	through the European electronic access
through the European electronic access	point. The payment systems shall be
point.	accessible for persons with
	disabilities.
luctifi	ontion:
Jusiii	cation:

Accessible payment systems are very important for users with disabilities. This means that it is also imperative that Article 4 on Establishment of a European electronic access points requires compliance with accessibility requirements set out in annex I of Directive (EU) 2019/882.

Article 12 (adoption of implementing acts by the Commission) and article 13 (reference implementation software)

Commission proposal	Proposed amendments
Article 12 Adoption of implementing acts	Article 12 Adoption of implementing acts
by the Commission	by the Commission
 The Commission shall adopt implementing acts establishing the decentralised IT system, setting out the following: (a)the technical specifications defining the methods of communication by electronic means for the purposes of the decentralised IT system; (b)the technical specifications for communication protocols; (c)the information security objectives and relevant technical measures ensuring minimum 	1. The Commission shall adopt implementing acts establishing the decentralised IT system, setting out the following: (a)the technical specifications defining the methods of communication by electronic means for the purposes of the decentralised IT system; (b)the technical specifications for communication protocols; (c)the information security objectives and relevant technical measures ensuring minimum

information security standards and a high level of cybersecurity for the processing and communication of information within the decentralised IT system; (d)the minimum availability objectives and possible related technical requirements for the services provided by the decentralised IT system;	information security standards and a high level of cybersecurity for the processing and communication of information within the decentralised IT system; (d)the minimum availability objectives and possible related technical requirements for the services provided by the decentralised IT system; (e) the accessibility of the decentralised IT system.
Article 13 Reference implementation software	Article 13 Reference implementation software
 The Commission shall be responsible for the creation, maintenance and development of reference implementation software which Member States may choose to apply as their back-end system instead of a national IT system. The creation, maintenance and development of the reference implementation software shall be financed from the general budget of the Union. The Commission shall provide, maintain and support on a free- of-charge basis the reference implementation software. 	 The Commission shall be responsible for the creation, <i>accessibility</i>, maintenance and development of reference implementation software which Member States may choose to apply as their back-end system instead of a national IT system. The creation, maintenance and development of the reference implementation software shall be financed from the general budget of the Union. The Commission shall provide, maintain and support on a free-of-charge basis the reference implementation software.
Justifi	cation:

Products intended for use by natural persons, whether general public or staff of the should take into account accessibility criteria for persons with disabilities or design for all users.

Proposed new recitals

Commission proposal	Proposed amendments
	New recital:
	By respectively ratifying and concluding the United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (UN CRPD), the Member States and the Union have committed themselves to taking appropriate measures to ensure equal access to information and communication technologies and systems, as well as access to justice for persons with disabilities, including through the provision of procedural and age-appropriate accommodations, in order to facilitate their effective role as direct and indirect participants of the justice system. The Commission communication of the 3 May 2021 'Union of Equality: Strategy for the Rights of Persons with Disabilities 2021-2030' builds on the UN CRPD and sets out action to be taken in several priority areas including improving access to justice, legal protection, freedom and security.
	New recital
	Union law provides for accessibility requirements improving the equal access to persons with disabilities to information and communication technology that also have the potential to further improve access to justice of persons with disabilities. Directive (EU) 2019/882 sets out EU harmonized accessibility requirements for a range of ICT products and services, such as computers and operating systems, electronic communications, or digital identification and payment methods, among others. Union law is supported by harmonised standards that judicial administration can use to procure accessible technology in line with the Directive 2014/24/EU and Directive 2014/25/EU.
	New recital
	In the context of this Regulation, accessibility should be understood as principles and

techniques to be observed when designing, constructing, maintaining, and updating websites, software, electronic communications, videoconferencing and other distance
communication technology in order to make them more accessible to users, in particular persons with disabilities.
New recital
Procedural accommodation is essential to remove barriers in the justice system and to ensure equal access to remedy and fair trial for persons with disabilities. Such accommodation must be granted when needed and requested by persons with disabilities who are direct or indirect participants of the justice system. Such accommodation may include the provision of sign language interpretation, tactile sign interpretation, speech-to-text functionality, Easy to Read and Braille formats, among others, and should be considered in the implementation of this Regulation as a way to ensure equal access to hearing through videoconferencing or other distance communication technology.
Justification:

These new recitals include essential references to the United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, as well as relevant EU policies and instruments setting out accessibility requirements necessary to ensure the equal rights of persons with disabilities in judicial cooperation and access to justice.

Document credits

This document was prepared by Marine Uldry, EDF Senior Human Rights Officer (<u>marine.uldry@edf-feph.org</u>).

Assisted by Carine Marzin and Alejandro Moledo.



The European Disability Forum Mundo Madou Avenue des Arts 7-8 1210 Brussels, Belgium.

www.edf-feph.org

info@edf-feph.org

This publication has received financial support from the European Union. The information contained in this publication does not necessarily reflect the official position of the European Commission.

